IG
Irish Geography

MAY 2018
ISSN: 0075-0778 (Print) 1939-4055 (Online)

http://www.irishgeography.ie

Book Reviews

How to cite: Wilson, T. (2018) 'Review: J. Crowley, D. Ó Drisceoil and M. Murphy (2017) Atlas of the Irish Revolution'. Irish Geography, 51(1), 137-139, DOI: 10.2014/igj.v51i1.1355

How to cite: Sage, C. (2018) 'Review: A. Fraser (2017) Global Foodscapes: Oppression and resistance in the life of food'. Irish Geography, 51(1), 139-140, DOI: 10.2014/igj.v51i1.1357

Geographical Society of Ireland
An Cumann Tíreolaíochta na hÉireann

Irish Geography
Vol. 51, No. 1 May 2018
DOI: 10.2014/igj.v51i1.1355 10.2014/igj.v51i1.1357

Geographical Society of Ireland
An Cumann Tíreolaíochta na hÉireann

Book Reviews

John Crowley, Donal Ó Drisceoil and Mike Murphy (eds.), ***Atlas of the Irish Revolution*** (Cork University Press, 2017), 964 pages, Hardback, €59.00
ISBN 9781782051176

Rosencrantz: I don't believe it in anyway.
Guildenstern: What?
Rosencrantz: England.
Guildenstern: Just a conspiracy of cartographers, then?

Tom Stoppard, *Rosencrantz and Guildenstern are dead*

All those with bad backs will curse ever having picked up this monster production; all others will rejoice. An academic army has contributed to this atlas through the production of 140 separate contributions. As the product of such an extended conspiracy of cartographers, but also of historians, geographers, political scientists and literary scholars (amongst others), the resulting volume succeeds resplendently in its lighting the Irish Revolution from both conventional, and highly unexpected, angles. As the editors themselves assert, 'in many ways the *Atlas of the Irish Revolution* reflects a snapshot of the field's evolving research and literature when the project began in 2013'.

As David Fitzpatrick observes here, 'old-fashioned geography, the study of maps, remains an essential yet underused tool for dissecting and explaining Ireland's revolutionary experience'. This volume triumphantly shows what can be achieved in an age of Global Positioning System technology in terms of plotting a mass of old data in new ways: fresh patterns can be uncovered, and known ones greatly clarified. Revolutionary Ireland here represents an exemplary case – here the population was small, the communication network relatively dense and efficient and the British state bureaucracy, whilst compromised in 1919-1921, survived intact enough to document its own decline with a sort of obsessive fascination. Indeed, very few 20th century revolutions can have been charted with this kind of detail.

And there truly is a banquet of detail on which the reader may gorge here – although the provision of heavyweight overview essays and editorial breadth of vision prevent this atlas sinking into mere antiquarianism. The atlas, indeed, serves as a striking reminder that even in small wars – as Ireland's Troubles of 1919-23 surely were by any global reckoning – an awful lot can still happen. If, for instance, it is hardly a revelation that Munster deserves its reputation as the vortex of much of violent conflict in the 1919-1921 period, it is still highly illuminating to see this charted systematically through original maps depicting, for instance, 'Volunteers as a percentage of the total male population', 'IRA attacks on Crown forces', 'Creamery Attacks', 'Map showing civilians identified as suspects by the IRA's 1st Southern Division's Intelligence Department' and so on. There is

a kind of percussive force to this accumulation of measured detail that is highly suggestive for imagining what life in such areas at such times must actually have been like – a point further amplified by the generous provision of contemporary photos, or reproductions of material objects (posters, military passes, notebook pages, etc.). However, the glory of this volume remains its maps.

This visual feast certainly whets the appetite for more. As the editors honestly acknowledge in their introduction, not all regions have been covered equally – even a project of this scope and ambition must inevitably reflect the strengths and weaknesses of a hundred years' worth of reflection on the Irish Revolution. The North remains in somewhat softer focus – although, in fairness, the attention paid to Lisburn in charting both UVF membership and the riot damage from the troubled summer of 1920 is highly arresting. There is surely much more that could be done here – a more fine-grained portrait of support for the Ulster Solemn League and Covenant in 1912 would surely complement the basic mapping by county reproduced in this volume. Nevertheless, the gaping hole in our understanding of the emergence of Northern Ireland surely remains the resilience of the constitutional nationalist tradition, even in the face of the rise of Sinn Féin. An attempt systematically to map the distribution of lodges of the Ancient Order of Hibernians would, for instance, be invaluable: as would some attempt to chart the fluctuations in its support. Over recent decades, the historiography of the period has swung wildly from ignoring the Devlinite/Hibernian tradition towards emphasising its deep mutual hostility to the Republican movement. Arguably, this is a definite advance, but still a partial one. There is a need for research projects that charts the sheer complexity of shifting patterns of cooperation and conflict within the northern nationalist community in this vital period. Our understanding of the interplay between sectarian conflict and Republican insurgency remains strangely underdeveloped.

However, such comments are second order laments at most. They are more than counter-balanced by the generosity of vision that underlies the compilation of this volume. A refreshing sub-theme is the editorial willingness to look outwards in their attempt to situate the Irish Revolution globally – with chapters dedicated both to the Irish American connection, but also to Gallipoli, coverage of the Easter Rising in the French Press, as well as wider European and imperial contexts. Conversely, though, the atlas also digs deep into some highly unexpected corners: the essay on the importance of cave systems to the Irish Revolution is an unexpected delight here. Particularly poignant is the discussion of the child dead of the Easter Rising; the 40 fatalities aged 16 or under, including the twelve-year-old John Kirwan whose body was only identified after a month by (of all things) a 'lucky sixpence' he had carried. Spatially, detail and overview are judiciously balanced: temporally, neither the long-term background nor the post-1923 legacy are glossed over. Resonances and silences are traced through discussions of culture, historiography, memory, stories and film-making (amongst other areas). The end result is a visual and analytical banquet.

Retailing at just 59 Euros for 964 pages full of erudition, more than 300 original maps, and lavish reproductions of contemporary sources, this handsomely produced

volume represents extraordinary value for money. Moreover, the promise of an auxiliary website to enhance and buttress this volume with fresh scholarship also bodes well for the future reputation of this landmark study. In an age of rampant short-termism, the editors and Cork University Press have embraced a more ambitious, but also accessible, vision of what true scholastic achievement should look like. They deserve our commendation and our gratitude.

Dr. Tim Wilson
Handa Centre for the Study of Terrorism and Political Violence, University of St. Andrews
Arts Faculty Building, Library Park, The Scores, St Andrews, Fife, KY16 9AX, Scotland, UK
Email: tkw2@st-andrews.ac.uk

Global Foodscapes: Oppression and resistance in the life of food by Alistair Fraser, Abingdon, UK, Routledge, 2017, 172 pp., £28.99 (paperback) ISBN 9781138192485.

Underpinning this book is an attempt to grapple with, what Fraser calls, 'the proletarian food question', the way in which capitalism has developed a system that delivers low cost food to workers. As one might presume, this places the book squarely within the political economy tradition of agri-food studies but one with a particular focus on issues of oppression and resistance. Drawing upon the work of Iris Young, the feminist political philosopher who developed the model of five faces of oppression, Fraser explores the ways in which powerlessness, violence, marginalisation, exploitation and cultural imperialism might be found within five different stages of the global food economy. These stages provide the basic structure of the book: following an Introduction, successive chapters deal with the 'world upstream of the farm', agriculture, food processing, food retailing and food consumption. Each chapter then follows a similar structure with a general description of the major dynamics and largest corporate interests dominating that stage. The penultimate section is subtitled 'In what sense oppressive?' and the final section highlights examples of resistance.

The shortcomings of the contemporary food system are now well known beyond the boundaries of higher education and there is no shortage of publications that give full voice to criticisms and also set forth policies for more sustainable, secure and socially just food production and provisioning arrangements. So where does this slight volume, aimed at an undergraduate readership, hope to contribute within an increasingly crowded food studies literature?

The particular focus that Fraser brings to questions of oppression and resistance within each of the stages of the food system is certainly useful, but it reads as a generally discursive commentary that is more anecdotal than data-rich, and occasionally suffers from inadequate and imprecise definition. In the chapter devoted to 'the world upstream of the farm', for example, we are first introduced to 'northern agriculture' – aka 'capitalist' agriculture – before reviewing the power of the major input suppliers, and a case study of Monsanto. Given that the next chapter makes clear the degree of penetration of this technology-driven *productivist* paradigm in countries of the South,

the choice of hemispheric label seems oddly inappropriate. But what forms of oppression and resistance apply here? Fraser argues that Iris Young's notion of powerlessness fits best and is 'experienced by billions of people' given that only a very small number make decisions in boardrooms about the sort of food we all eat. Resistance to such oppression is illustrated by the self-immolation of the Korean farmer in protest at the 2003 WTO meeting in Cancun, or less dramatically by open-source seed breeding and exchange.

Subsequent chapters provide a similarly broad-brush approach. In 'agricultural foodscapes' the 'face of oppression' that is chosen is violence – not without good reason given the history and ongoing experience of land seizure, enclosure and expulsion – and resistance is appropriately illustrated by Brazil's landless rural workers movement. In food processing, marginalisation is the chosen face of oppression – though not until after the food processing industry is applauded for driving down the cost of food paid for by workers, which seems strangely paradoxical. And resistance? This is illustrated with reference to Glenisk, the Irish dairy company that has become a highly successful global producer of yoghurt. What Fraser fails to note, however, is that Glenisk is part-owned by Danone, the world's largest dairy company by value of retail sales. The Glenisk story, then, is certainly one of economic success. Indeed, it is laudable that the company is committed to the use of certified organic ingredients and electric vehicles in its business. But if we are to speak of genuine change in the global foodscape then we require more critical awareness around the corporate takeover of small iconic producers – a feature that is well underway here across the organic food and craft beer sectors especially.

The final two chapters deal with the selling of food and its consumption and follow a similar pattern to what precedes them. Both are brief and while offering some useful glimpses into the worlds of supermarkets, fast food and the changing place of cooking, they fail to develop a sustained line of argument around the creation and maintenance of foodscapes, a disappointment given the prominence of this term in the book's title. Moreover, while Young's five faces of oppression model provides a distinctive twist when applied to the food system, examples of resistance remain somewhat limited. Thus, in speaking of resistance to oppression in relation to consumption, Fraser speaks of boycotts (widespread and important) and then of his own efforts to bake bread and cook pasta sauce. I'm sure both are very good, but where is the discussion of civic initiatives creating genuine local alternatives to the corporate food system? Where also are discussions about the practice of urban agriculture, which is steadily expanding in countries of the North and South; of public procurement schemes designed to shorten supply chains, support local farmers and keep value within the region; or of other food justice initiatives such as social supermarkets, food pantries and collective kitchens? Global Foodscapes is consequently a useful primer on the food system but its lack of pedagogical features and discursive anti-corporate commentary will not win it many favours if it is to make undergraduate reading lists.

Colin Sage
Department of Geography, University College Cork
College Road, Cork, Ireland
Email: c.sage@ucc.ie